



DEMOCRACYPLUS

MONITORING REPORT

ON IMPLEMENTATION OF LAW NO. 02/L-52 ON PRESCHOOL EDUCATION

DECEMBER, 2020





MONITORING REPORT

ON IMPLEMENTATION OF LAW NO. 02/L-
52 ON PRESCHOOL EDUCATION

DECEMBER, 2020

D+ is grateful to the **National Endowment for Democracy (NED)** for financial support of this initiative.

Views expressed in this report do not necessarily reflect the views of the donor.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, photocopied means or otherwise, without prior permission of D+.

Design and Layout: **Envinion**

For more information, please visit www.dplus.org

Table of contents

INTRODUCTION 6

METHODOLOGY 8

KEY FINDINGS..... 9

CONCLUSIONS AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS 24

APPENDIX I: BY-LAWS/SECONDARY LEGISLATION..... 25

Introduction

Early education is one of the most important stages of psychological and emotional development for children. Special stress and importance should be placed on this stage by parents, kindergarten educators and other social actors, as it is not only parents but the whole of society that contributes to the education of children. Multiple studies have shown that investing in this development stage establishes the foundations for a child's further development, and helps create a healthy generation, both physically and mentally. Early education is also critically important due to the fact that the brain develops rapidly at this stage, and has a much higher capacity for change.

Children's rights and wellbeing have been outlined through two Declarations on the Rights of the Child that have been adopted by the majority of democratic states. The necessity to provide special protections to children is affirmed by both the Geneva Declaration on the Rights of the Child, adopted in 1924, and the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of the Child, which was adopted on November 20, 1959 and has been acknowledged in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Pact on Civil and Political Rights (especially articles 23 and 24), the International Pact on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (in particular article 10) and the respective statutes and instruments of specialized agencies and international organisations dealing with the wellbeing of children.¹ All of these international instruments see the wellbeing of the child as an absolute necessity, while signatory states have agreed that caring for children must be a priority for society.

One route to ensuring the wellbeing of children is through investing in high quality education, from preschool to middle school. Providing equal opportunities to all children and ensuring access to preschool education is also greatly beneficial, as early education is irreplaceably important in a child's development.

However, despite its importance, Kosovo has struggled to include children in early education, due to a serious lack of public preschool institutions, and a failure to include all children in the process, especially those living in rural areas, those on social welfare, children with special needs and those from marginalized groups.

Struggles in advancing preschool education stems from the failure to properly implement the Law on Preschool Education, as well as a lack of assessment of the implementation of this law. Other challenges include the high rates of unemployment among women due to their perceived responsibility to raise children, the material restrictions facing families on social welfare schemes that make it difficult to send children to preschool institutions, and a lack of physical infrastructure for children with special needs. One of the essential benefits of strengthening preschool education in Kosovo would be its impact on improving employment amongst women. Statistics on women's employment levels are alarming, with only 13.7% of women being employed, compared to 79.6% that are economically inactive,² figures that place Kosovo amongst the countries with the lowest inclusion of women in the labour market. This means that preschool education is also an important factor in assisting the economic development of the country, as a higher participation of children in preschool education can be a contributing factor to improving women's inclusion in the economy.

1 General Assembly of the United Nations "Convention on the Rights of the Child", (1989). Accessible at: OHCHR | Convention on the Rights of the Child

2 GAP Institute "Employment and representation of women in Kosovo. A Statistical Report. (2019). Available at: <https://www.institutigap.org/documents/15894-Raporti%20Pun%C3%ABsimi%20dhe%20p%C3%ABfaq%C3%ABsimi%20i%20grave%20n%C3%AB%20Kosov%C3%AB%202019%20-finalALB%20-%202012.pdf>

In 2006, the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo adopted Law No. 02L-52 on Preschool Education, which established the legal basis for the organisation of the preschool education system in Kosovo. However, preschool education is also regulated through other laws such as:

- *Law No. 03/L-068 on Education in the Municipalities of the Republic of Kosovo*
- *Law no. 04/L-032 on Pre-University Education in Kosovo*

Other accompanying documents include administrative instructions, national strategies, strategic plans and different curricula, which define the scope and dynamics within preschool education,



ONE ROUTE TO ENSURING THE WELLBEING OF CHILDREN IS THROUGH INVESTING IN HIGH QUALITY EDUCATION, FROM PRESCHOOL TO MIDDLE SCHOOL. PROVIDING EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES TO ALL CHILDREN AND ENSURING ACCESS TO PRESCHOOL EDUCATION IS ALSO GREATLY BENEFICIAL, AS EARLY EDUCATION IS IRREPLACEABLY IMPORTANT IN A CHILD'S DEVELOPMENT.

Methodology

The main purpose of this research document is to provide an overall assessment of the implementation of the Law on Preschool Education and inform citizens of the Republic of Kosovo and members of the Kosovo Assembly about the extent of the implementation of the law, the needs for intervention in specific segments of the law, and the challenges in implementing and addressing these amendments with the competent bodies. It also aims to analyse the content of the law in order to assess whether it is in line with other secondary legislation, if the legal infrastructure has been completed and what obligations derive for central and local levels of governance from the law and by-laws.

In order to reach the aforementioned goals, a qualitative method was used in interpreting the data derived from primary and secondary sources. For the primary sources, four (4) representatives from organisations working on the wellbeing and education of children were interviewed, as well as one (1) member of staff of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. In assessing the implementation of the Law on Preschool Education, legislation and bylaws related to preschool education, International Conventions on the Rights of the Child, and reports from international and local organisations regarding preschool education were carefully analysed, alongside other documents.



ONE ROUTE TO ENSURING THE WELLBEING OF CHILDREN IS THROUGH INVESTING IN HIGH QUALITY EDUCATION, FROM PRESCHOOL TO MIDDLE SCHOOL. PROVIDING EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES TO ALL CHILDREN AND ENSURING ACCESS TO PRESCHOOL EDUCATION IS ALSO GREATLY BENEFICIAL, AS EARLY EDUCATION IS IRREPLACEABLY IMPORTANT IN A CHILD'S DEVELOPMENT.

Key findings

The Law on Preschool Education (No. 02/L-52) was adopted by the Kosovo Assembly on March 6, 2006, by the Provisional Institutions of Self-government in Kosovo and based on the Constitutional Framework on Local Self-government in Kosovo (Regulation no. 2001/9 adopted on 15 May 2001).³ In order to supplement the law, the MEST issued administrative instructions, with thirteen of them crucial to regulating preschool education (see Appendix A).

By-laws deriving from the Law regulate the legal basis of its implementation to a great extent. However, as will be elaborated further, specific parts of the Law are not implemented, causing shortcomings in regulating preschool education in the country. The fundamental principles established in the Law (Article 4) on Preschool Education include:

- Equality;
- Inclusiveness;
- Democracy;
- Autonomy of the staff;
- Professionalism and responsibility
- Equal opportunities for children and parents, including differences amongst children
- The right to be different
- Comprehensive development of the personality of children.

A Inclusion

This principle is essential to the implementation of the law, as it should guarantee the inclusion of all children. However, shortcomings in its implementation have been found. Kosovo has only 44 public preschool institutions across the country, which does not guarantee inclusion of all children at this important and formative stage of education. In 2018, “about 9,100 children aged 1-5 years old were registered in a pre-school institution in Kosovo. This is a very low number, considering that Kosovo has about 110,000 children aged 1-5 years old, thus less than 10% are able to enroll in preschool education”.⁴

³ Official Gazette of the Republic of Kosovo, 'Law No. 02/L-52 on Pre-School Education', (2006). Available at: <https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=2401>

⁴ Statement of Dukagjin Pupovci for Kallxo.com (12.10.2018), 'Kosovo has only 42 public kindergartens'. Available at: <https://kallxo.com/shkurt/kosova-me-vetem-42-cerdhe-publike/>

Table 1: Number of public preschool kindergartens and attendance in 2019 and 2020 by municipality

Municipalities 2019/2020	Preschool/kindergartens	Attendance
Deçan	-	-
Dragash	-	4 ⁵
Ferizaj	1	202
Fushë Kosova	1	148
Gjakovë	5	371
Gjilan	4	281
Glogovc	2	99
Hani i Elezit	-	-
Istog	5	332
Junik	-	32
Kaçanik	1	57
Kamenica	1	108
Klina	1	110
Leposaviq	-	-
Lipjan	1	86
Malisheva	1	86
Mamusha	1	-
Mitrovica	1	218
Novo Brdo	-	-
Obiliq	1	70

5 Attendance has been estimated based on schools with pre-school level classes.

Municipalities 2019/2020	Preschool/kindergartens	Attendance
Peja	1	99
Podujevo	1	61
Prishtina	8	1,205
Prizren	-	13
Rahovec	1	
Shterpce	-	
Shtime	1	
Skënderaj	1	
Suhareka	3	
Viti	1	
Vushtrri	1	
Zubin Potok	-	
Zveçan	-	
Klllokot	-	
Ranillug	-	
Partesh	-	
Total	44	

Source: Kosovo Agency of Statistics, Ministry of Education, Science and Culture

According to these statistics, thirteen (13) municipalities in the Republic of Kosovo do not have any public kindergartens, which makes it impossible for families on social welfare or those with either limited or no income to enroll their children in preschool. Meanwhile, attendance is high in municipalities that have public preschool institutions. Therefore, as there is clearly a strong interest in these municipalities, it is essential to establish more public kindergartens, so that all children have a chance to attend.

Limited access to preschool institutions, especially those that are public, low cost and have a good reputation of taking care of children, also affects the inclusion of women in the labour market. A report by the Kosovo Women's Network found that 88% of unemployed women stated that they would take their children to day-care if it was accessible and affordable.⁶

Based on this premise, the Law and its administrative instructions have not guaranteed preconditions for inclusion in preschool institutions.

Per the legal provisions, inclusiveness also foresees inclusion of all children in preschool education institutions regardless of ethnicity, language, and religion. However, inclusion of non-majority communities in pre-school education institutions is rare in Kosovo. There are no public kindergartens in Serb-majority municipalities, and even in municipalities that have public kindergartens, attendance among children from non-majority communities is very low.

Table 2: Attendance data for public preschool institutions based on ethnic background

Municipalities 2019/2020	Albanian	Serbian	Roma	Turkish	Bosnian	Gorani
Deçan	-	-	-	-	-	-
Dragash	-	-	-	4	-	-
Ferizaj	211	-	-	-	-	-
Fushe Kosova	147	-	-	-	-	-
Gjakova	364	-	-	-	-	7
Gjilan	341	-	-	-	-	-
Glogovc	109	-	-	-	-	-
Hani I Elezit	-	-	-	-	-	-
Istog	232	-	-	-	-	-
Junik	31	-	-	-	-	-
Kaçanik	57	-	-	-	-	-
Kamenica	77	23	-	-	8	-

⁶ Kosovo Women's Network - KWN 'Who looks after them? Demand, offers and option to increase care opportunities for Kosovo children' (2016), p.8. Available at: <https://womensnetwork.org/wpcontent/uploads/2018/10/20161103153827479.pdf>

Municipalities 2019/2020	Albanian	Serbian	Roma	Turkish	Bosnian	Gorani
Klinë	109	-	-	-	-	-
Leposaviq	-	-	-	-	-	-
Lipjan	86	-	-	-	-	-
Malisheva	86	-	-	-	-	-
Mamusha	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mitrovica	318	-	-	-	-	-
Novoberdo	-	-	-	-	-	-
Obiliq	70	-	-	-	-	-
Pejë	99	-	-	-	-	-
Podujeva	61	-	-	-	-	-
Prishtina	1.195	-	10	-	-	-
Prizren	13	-	-	-	1	-
Rahovec	54	-	-	-	-	-
Shterpca	-	-	-	-	-	-
Shtime	45	-	-	-	-	-
Skenderaj	75	-	-	-	-	-
Suhareka	101	-	-	-	-	-
Viti	100	-	-	-	-	-
Vushtrri	130	-	-	-	-	-
Zubin Potok	-	-	-	-	-	-
Zveçan	-	-	-	-	-	-
Klllokot	-	-	-	-	-	-
Ranillug	:	:	:	:	:	:
Partesh	:	:	:	:	:	:

Source: Kosovo Statistics Agency, Ministry of Education, Science and Culture

According to this data, children from non-majority municipalities do not enroll in public preschool institutions. Reasons behind this may include a lack of public kindergartens in the municipalities and a lack of willingness amongst parents to enroll children due to fear of social rejection, or a feeling of inferiority. Actions that must be undertaken to tackle this phenomena include launching awareness-raising campaigns for all non-majority municipalities, in order to inform them about the importance of enrolling children in kindergarten. Educators must also receive training on teaching an ethnically diverse set of children in order to ensure that children are not treated differently, while children must be taught the importance of tolerance and living together alongside different cultures.

B Support to non-public initiatives

Article 27, point 1 of the Law on Preschool Education states that “the MEST and municipal bodies responsible for preschool education will aim to financially support non-public initiatives to provide preschool education services.” It goes on to state that: “With the purpose of increasing the percentage of children who have access to this type of education, as well as the overall quality of preschool education, the MEST and municipal bodies’ responsible for preschool education, when taking into consideration financial support, must bear in the mind the following:

- a) Geographic location of the community where the service is provided, especially rural and remote areas;
- b) Services for children with special needs;
- c) Staff of pre-school institutions must be employed in accordance with the legal framework;
- d) Open access to all children”.⁷

The lack of a clear definition of this objective, and defining it only as an objective, paved the way for these principles to not become a practice implemented by the majority of Kosovo municipalities. “An objective” must be measurable and defined in an obligatory manner, in order to increase the participation of as many children as possible at this level of education. According to Diellza Kukaj, Director of the Preschool Education Division at the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology: “Neither the law or the secondary legal framework have defined competencies between the central level of government (MEST) and the municipalities in many areas. They did not define competencies between various institutions at the central level either. This situation led to a low level of inclusion of children and a lack of quality in providing services to preschool education children, as well as the sustainability of important community centres”.⁸

However, successful cases of including the community in opening preschool institutions have been noted in the municipality of Prishtina, where several institutions have been opened that have all proven to be a success. Administrative Instruction No. 42/2007 defines a very important role for the community in the functioning of preschool education institutions, giving them extended competencies even in management. In Prishtina, this includes the use of a seven-member Committee that collects opinions in the community and aims to address them in coordination with the municipality. The successful examples in Prishtina are encouraging, and can be used as a role model for other municipalities when seeking to establish such institutions.

⁷ Official Gazette of the Republic of Kosovo ‘Law No. 02/L-52 on Pre-School Education’, (2006). Available at <https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=2401>

⁸ Interview with Diellza Kukaj, Director of the Pre-School Education Division, Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. (Prishtina, 21 October 2020).

Article 27, point 1 of the Law on Preschool Education states that “the MEST and municipal bodies responsible for preschool education will aim to financially support non-public initiatives to provide preschool education services.” It goes on to state that: “With the purpose of increasing the percentage of children who have access to this type of education, as well as the overall quality of preschool education, the MEST and municipal bodies’ responsible for preschool education, when taking into consideration financial support, must bear in the mind the following:

- A** Geographic location of the community where the service is provided, especially rural and remote areas;
 - B** Services for children with special needs;
 - C** Staff of pre-school institutions must be employed in accordance with the legal framework;
 - D** Open access to all children”.
-

C Inclusion of children with special needs

Point 2.4 of Article 3 of the Law on Preschool Education envisages preschool education as voluntary, despite many studies assessing this level of education as crucially important. “Healthy development during the early years enables the establishment of brain blocks for academic achievements, economic productivity, civic responsibility, healthy life and successful parenting for the next generation”.⁹

Other important elements of the principles of preschool education include **ensuring equal opportunities for children and parents, taking into consideration the advantages and disadvantages amongst children, and the right to be different.**

In this regard, special importance is placed on the inclusion of children with special needs, children on social welfare and non-majority communities.

It is also stated in Article 6 of the Law that preschool education is a right for every child, including those with special needs, which must be exercised in compliance with the Law and secondary legislation. Point 6.2 meanwhile envisages the categories of children with special needs that are included in this Law.

Point 6 of **Article 4 of Administrative Instruction 19/2016** clearly defines this right, while also sets some conditions which are the subject of analysis and monitoring in this report. In point 6.1, it is stated that “children with serious impairments can be included in the [preschool institution], if the institution has adequate professional staff and other working conditions, depending on the type of impairment. Therefore, according to this article, children with serious impairments can attend kindergarten only if they have the professional staff, but if this is lacking, then they may not attend. However, the Law has not foreseen any provisions for the municipality or central level institutions to secure professional staff, and this remains one of the biggest challenges hindering the attendance of children with special needs in kindergartens.

There are special institutions in Kosovo that are responsible for the education of children that have physical, emotional, or psychological impairments. According to Law no. 04/L-032 on Preschool Education in the Republic of Kosovo, “the Ministry can establish and maintain resource centres, special schools and other units that provide special education for children with serious or multiple impairments or with learning difficulties, who are estimated to be unable to be educated in municipal schools or public vocational institutions.” There are currently seven (7) such special education schools providing education and training to children with special needs, including those with physical, emotional, and psychological impairments.

⁹ Behrami M., Pacolli F. and Ramqaj F. ‘Why early education is the solution?’. (Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 2020). Available at: <http://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/kosovo/16274-20201022.pdf>

Inclusion of children with special needs

Point 2.4 of Article 3 of the Law on Preschool Education envisages preschool education as voluntary, despite many studies assessing this level of education as crucially important.

“Healthy development during the early years enables the establishment of brain blocks for academic achievements, economic productivity, civic responsibility, healthy life and successful parenting for the next generation”

There are special institutions in Kosovo that are responsible for the education of children that have physical, emotional, or psychological impairments. According to Law no. 04/L-032 on Preschool Education in the Republic of Kosovo

“The Ministry can establish and maintain resource centres, special schools and other units that provide special education for children with serious or multiple impairments or with learning difficulties, who are estimated to be unable to be educated in municipal schools or public vocational institutions.”

Table 3: Attendance data on preschool institutions by children with special needs

2019/2020	Intellectual impairment	Hearing impairment	Visual impairment	Physical impairments
3 – 4 years	3	1	-	-
4 - 5 years	-	-	-	-
5 – 6 years	2	1	4	-

Source: Kosovo Statistics Agency, Ministry of Education, Science and Culture

Data indicates that attendance in special preschool institutions amongst children with impairments and special needs was low in 2019 and 2020. The number of children with speech, communication and language difficulties attending special kindergartens is higher, while children with physical impairments, autism, emotional disorders and Down syndrome are not involved in preschool institutions at all. This is particularly worrying, as it is precisely these children that need care and socialisation with other children the most. By not providing the necessary space and opportunities for these children to attend kindergarten, Kosovo is failing to fulfil important criteria. All of this has consequences on children with special needs, as it results in creating a feeling of inferiority from very early stages and contributes to difficulties in emotional and psychological developments due to lack of socialisation with other children and being confined within their own homes.

The lack of inclusion of children with special needs was also noted in the interviews conducted, with interviewees mentioning various circumstances contributing to the lack of implementation of the law and its fundamental principles. The HandiKos NGO assesses that “inclusion of children with special needs is regulated only through one article which is insufficient, and more opportunities and privileges must be created for these children.” Another challenge is the rejection of applications to attend kindergartens by children with special needs. The Law does not currently foresee any consequences for these rejections, but does stipulate the need to provide a written justification, which is frequently not issued. A lack of adequate infrastructure at kindergartens suitable for children with special needs remains another challenge, especially a lack of elevators or appropriate stairs for the children.¹⁰

¹⁰ Interview with Kaltrina Misini, Handikos representative. (Pristina, 21 October 2020).

Multiple impairments	Speech, communication and language difficulties	Autism	Emotional and behavioural disorders	Learning difficulties/disorders	Down Syndrome
1	9	-	-	-	-
-	-	-	-	-	-
38	9	-	-	-	-

Meanwhile, a representative from the Collegium of Principals of Preschool Institutions outlined some of the toughest challenges that institutions face in accommodating children with special needs, conceding that “the situation is not satisfactory, as there is no harmonization of the program with their special educational needs.” She cited cases of educators not wanting to deal with children who have special requests and stated that most educators working in kindergartens do not have professional qualifications on how to provide the emotional and psychological support required for children with special needs.

One recommendation in relation to this specific finding is for the “University of Prishtina program on preschool education to add classes that professionally prepare kindergarten educators to deal with children with special needs so that they will be ready in the future”.¹¹



INCLUSION OF CHILDREN WITH SPECIAL NEEDS IS REGULATED ONLY THROUGH ONE ARTICLE WHICH IS INSUFFICIENT, AND MORE OPPORTUNITIES AND PRIVILEGES MUST BE CREATED FOR THESE CHILDREN

¹¹ Interview with Mevlude Murtezi, Chairwoman of the Collegium of Principals of Pre-School Institutions. (Prishtina, 21 October 2020).

D Inclusion of children of families on social welfare

The inclusion of children from families on social welfare is defined in Article 24 (definition of fees paid by parents), which stipulates that parents on social welfare are exempt from payment. In Administrative Instruction 19/2016, Article 4, point 7, stipulates that in cases of exemptions from payment, parents/legal guardians must prove this through an official document issued by the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare. Meanwhile, point 10 of the same article obliges municipalities to subsidize children exempt from payment.

A UNICEF Kosovo representative said that this article is not applied in all cases,¹² a claim which was reaffirmed by the Chairwoman of the Collegium of Preschool Institutions Principals. Thus, it may be concluded that compliance with this legal provision, which is important in ensuring participation of families on social welfare (and therefore a crucial factor for future development), is low and it is imperative for institutions to oversee the implementation of the law.

Furthermore, it is only in public institutions that Administrative Instructions regulate fee systems and the inclusion of children from families on social welfare, as well as those with special needs. In order to increase the participation of children in the preschool education system, it is important for legal changes to define alternative forms of inclusion in private institutions (either through subsidies from the local level or other practices), as they make up the biggest number of preschool institutions in Kosovo.

E Employment in pre-school institutions



The level of preparation of the staff engaged in preschool education institutions is another challenge to the implementation of the law. Part VI of the Law defines the criteria for employment in preschool institutions, including qualification requirements, while point 28.4 clearly defines the type of education those employed in preschool education should have. One important fact worth emphasizing is the relative interest of both men and women to work in preschool institutions. In the table below, data on the employment of men and women in pre-school institutions in Kosovo are presented.





ONE IMPORTANT FACT WORTH EMPHASIZING IS THE RELATIVE INTEREST OF BOTH MEN AND WOMEN TO WORK IN PRESCHOOL INSTITUTIONS. IN THE TABLE BELOW, DATA ON THE EMPLOYMENT OF MEN AND WOMEN IN PRE-SCHOOL INSTITUTIONS IN KOSOVO ARE PRESENTED.

¹² Interview with Dafina Krasniqi, UNICEF Kosovo representative. (Prishtina, 19 October 2020)

Table 4: Data on employment of men and women in preschool institutions by municipality

2019/2020		Pre-school level	
Municipalities	 Men	 Women	
Deçan	-	-	
Dragash	-	-	
Ferizaj	-	25	
Fushe Kosova	-	21	
Gjakova	-	45	
Gjilan	-	44	
Glogovc	-	15	
Hani I Elezit	-	-	
Istog	-	20	
Junik	-	-	
Kaçanik	-	4	
Kamenica	-	7	
Klina	-	5	
Leposaviq	-	-	
Lipjan	-	12	
Malisheva	-	8	
Mamusha	-	3	
Mitrovica	-	29	
Novo Brdo	-	-	

2019/2020		Pre-school level	
Municipalities	 Men	 Women	
Obiliq	-	9	
Pejë	-	39	
Podujeva	-	8	
Prishtina	1	204	
Prizren	-	-	
Rahovec	-	4	
Shterpce	-	-	
Shtime	-	6	
Skenderaj	-	11	
Suhareka	-	8	
Viti	-	8	
Vushtrri	-	17	
Zubin Potok	-	-	
Zveçan	-	-	
Klllokot	-	-	
Ranillug	-	-	
Partesh	-	-	

Source: Kosovo Statistics Agency, Ministry of Education, Science and Culture

According to these statistics, the percentage of men interested in working at preschool institutions is very low, whereas the interest of women is very high. This is worrisome, as it only reinforces the belief that the position of educators is appropriate only for women. Participation of men in preschool education institutions is very far from European standards and those of developed countries, a practice that should not continue in the future. Children need professional educators, regardless of their gender.

Another difficulty facing pre-school education in Kosovo is the academic qualifications of educators, considering that the main subject of study for the majority of educators is how to educate children and prepare them for future education levels, whereas little attention is paid to the psychological and emotional development of the children. An important indicator for this argument is the fact that at the Faculty of Education at the University of Prishtina, classes at BA level on the socio-emotional and professional development of teachers are optional rather than obligatory. In order to have a higher level of preparation for educators, it is crucial that classes related to cognitive abilities and handling emotional and psychological problems become obligatory at the BA level.

Furthermore, aside from formal education, continuous training to advance the skills of educators are required. These trainings should be approved by the Ministry of Education and the latter should promote inclusive development based on global trends.¹³ The same training process must also be applied to private kindergartens as they are not accredited by MEST.

F Oversight on the law implementation

Oversight of the implementation of legislation is another crucial element to guaranteeing the higher standards and quality required by the Law. Part VIII of the Law outlines the levels of oversight, defining its implementation as a responsibility of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, while stating that inspection is a responsibility of the Inspectorate of the Ministry. Further, the professional, pedagogical role of the educator and professional associates are under the auspices of the MEST, or other professional persons authorised by the ministry. In order to implement high quality oversight, human resources must be increased, as the MEST has only “two officials dealing with pre-school education,”¹⁴ which is insufficient for such a wide scope of work. In order to ensure more meaningful oversight, it is crucial for changes to the Law to define a better division of roles and competencies between the local and central level, and to advance structures for better inter-institutional coordination.

¹³ Interview with Dafna Krasniqi, UNICEF Kosovo representative. (Prishtina, 20 October 2020).

¹⁴ Ibid.

Conclusions and policy recommendations

Law No. 02L-52 on Preschool Education, adopted in 2006, clearly defined the legal basis for the functioning of preschool education in Kosovo. The Law is complemented by other by-laws, regulating specific fields as regulated by the Law. Nevertheless, as this analysis has assessed, supplementing the Law is crucial in order to fulfil current needs, as well as to address some of the existing shortcomings. A fair supplementing of the Law would have a chain effect in other areas as well, such as the overall quality of education in the country and increased employment among women, which is currently at a very low level.

- Changes to the law must contain concrete methods for the inclusion of all children in preschool kindergartens. Inclusion of children from non-majority communities is crucial for the educational cohabitation of Kosovo Albanians with members of other ethnic communities. In this respect, more investment is required in material and human resources, especially in municipalities with a significant population of non-majority communities.
- According to this research, a lack of public preschool institutions has been noted in thirteen of Kosovo's municipalities. This gap must be addressed by establishing public kindergartens in every municipality and increasing the numbers of public kindergartens in municipalities with the highest populations. Through this method, attendance of all children at the preschool level can be ensured.
- Licencing of private pre-school education institutions should be done by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, in order to ensure that the implementation of the Law at these kindergartens is obligatory. One criteria for licencing should be the creation of pre-conditions for children with special needs to attend, which should also be obligatory at public kindergartens.
- Inclusion of children from families on social welfare must be addressed more clearly in the Law on Preschool Education. Despite the Administrative Instruction clearly sanctioning this for public institutions, it is not obligatory for private kindergartens. Therefore, drafting of amendments to the Law must include means of inclusion for children on social welfare in private preschool institutions, as a method of ensuring the integration of this category into society.
- Investing in non-formal education for the staff must also be regulated through the Law. The new Law must clearly stipulate the need for non-formal education of educators who work with children with special needs, or the inclusion of teaching-assistants that would work specifically with this category. If the family or the kindergarten cannot finance the non-formal education of the educators, this should be covered by the municipalities in order to provide some advantages to the already disadvantaged.
- Increasing the number of oversight staff (inspectors) in the work of preschool institutions must be a priority. The lack of staff engaged in monitoring the work of preschool institutions has caused, in many cases, a lack of effective implementation of the Law. Inspectors overseeing the work of pre-school institutions must be well-prepared, have preschool education qualifications, and should inspect public and private institutions on a monthly basis, without exception. The purpose of the inspection must be the implementation of the Law on Preschool Institutions, the assessment of implementation of teaching programmes, and the level of education of the educators amongst other issues.

Appendix I: By-laws/Secondary legislation

- 1 Administrative Instruction **No. 12/2006** on the Implementation of General Standards of preschool education (3-6 years old) in Kosovo, dated 25.04.2006
- 2 Administrative Instruction **No. 13/2006** on curriculum implementation for preschool education (3-6 years old), dated 25.04.2006
- 3 Administrative Instruction **No. 41/2007** on decreasing fees paid by parents when they have more than one child at preschool institutions, dated 09.10.2007.
- 4 Administrative Instruction **No. 42/2007** on conditions and opportunities for supporting education amongst minority communities, dated 09.10.2007
- 5 Administrative Instruction **No. 43/2007** on defining procedures, cases and deadlines to suspend the work of pre-school institutions, dated 09.10.2007.
- 6 Administrative Instruction **No. 44/2007** on the duration of other school programmes, dated 09.10.2007.
- 7 Administrative Instruction No. **45/2007** on publication (announcement) of organisation of preschool institutions, dated 09.10.2007.
- 8 Administrative Instruction **No. 46/2007** on the form of selecting pre-school programmes by parents of the children, dated 09.10.2007.
- 9 Administrative Instruction **No. 47/2007** on the fund of classes for educators, dated 09.10.2007.
- 10 Administrative Instruction **No. 1/2008** on the Steering Committee, Compositions, competencies and commission of the Committee, form of selection of management and personnel of pre-school institutions, dated 03.03.2008.
- 11 Administrative Instruction **No. 2/2008** on dedicated means of financing public preschool education and forms of expenditure, dated 03.03.2008.
- 12 Administrative Instruction **No. 15/2016** on the Licencing and Registration of Private Preschool Educational institutions, dated 03.08.2016.
- 13 Administrative Instruction **No. 19/2016** on inclusion of children in preschool institutions in Kosovo, dated 26.08.2016.





Supported by:

