

Annual Report 2024

December, 2024



Discover more about our latest publications, news, and online infographics.

f @democracyplus

in @democracy-plus

🥑 @democracy_plus 🕞 @Democracy Plus

Str. Bajram Kelmendi, Nr.92, Floor IV, Prishtinë, 10000 Kosovë

+383 (0) 38 749 288 info@dplus.org

About Democracy Plus	The Impact of D+ on Recycling and Environmental Protection	Contribution to Public Policies
Public Procurement Monitoring	Efforts to Prevent the Spread of Fake News	Reports and Fixes on the ndreqe.com Platform
22	28	30
Other Activities	Partners and Donors	
30	36	

About Democracy Plus

We are an independent and non-profit organization founded in 2016, dedicated to building a democratic society in Kosovo. Our mission focuses on increasing citizen participation in political processes, promoting accountability, and influencing decision-making at all levels of governance. We leverage information technology to advance these efforts, supporting the use of digital tools to democratize and modernize our society.

Our work contributes to establishing good governance practices in public institutions at both the central and local levels, strengthening the rule of law, developing political parties, and supporting free and fair electoral processes. Through research, public dialogue, and education, our initiatives aim to bridge the gap between decision-makers and citizens. Above all, we uphold democratic values and practices, empowering the voices of Kosovo's citizens and promoting a more inclusive and participatory society.

Throughout 2024, D+ has continued working to build a democratic culture through numerous activities aimed at influencing decision-making, strengthening transparency and institutional accountability, increasing citizen participation in policymaking, and improving the development of public procurement procedures.

This report presents a summary of the activities carried out by D+ during 2024 and their impact in fulfilling our mission.

Vision

Governance and societies where democratic culture and values are the norm.

Mission

D+ is committed to the development of a democratic society, through influencing decision-making and strengthening civic participation in the design and implementation of public policies.

Programs

Good Governance

Rule of Law

Political Parties and Elections

1. D+'s Impact on Recycling and Environmental Protection

1.1 Empowering Local Heroes in Recycling

As part of USAID's Recycling Matters Activity – Gracanica, informal waste collectors from the Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian communities participated in practical training on safety and sustainable recycling practices. The training focused on two key topics: handling hazardous materials, and the basics of starting social enterprises in the recycling sector. Through hands-on demonstrations, participants explored how recycling can create economic and social value for marginalized communities—building skills for workplace safety, better livelihoods, and a cleaner environment. Participants explored how recycling can create economic and social value for marginalized communities.





1.2 A New Path to the Future for Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian Communities in Gracanica

Berjan Celic, once an informal waste collector, now runs his own recycling business with the support of USAID's Recycling Matters Activity -Gracanica. Originally from the village of Preoc in Gracanica, Berjan began working in recycling more than two decades ago with nothing but a cart to collect copper, aluminum, zinc, steel, and other metals from landfills. USAID provided Berjan with machinery for collecting and compressing recyclable materials and transporting them to recycling centers. He also received support to register his business. This support has significantly increased the amount of metals and plastics he processes each month, generating additional income to support his family. Through the USAID's Recycling Matters Activity -Gracanica,

Berjan, along with two other newly registered businesses and informal waste collectors, are working to improve their lives by dedicating time and effort to environmental protection.

This support has significantly increased the amount of metals and plastics he processes each month, generating additional income to support his family.

1.3. Collaboration in Action

Building connections between public institutions and marginalized communities leads to inclusive change and positive outcomes. Through a dynamic and comprehensive approach, USAID's Recycling Matters Activity – Gracanica organized a series of meetings throughout 2024 between members of the Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian communities and municipal officials to seek collaborative solutions for advancing socio-economic integration.

A key discussion was held between women from these communities and the Mayor of Gracanica, Ms. Ljiljana Subaric. Topics included employment, education, public infrastructure, housing, the environment, and economic challenges. The mayor emphasized the municipality's commitment to improving living conditions for all community members, while municipal representatives expressed readiness to address these challenges through joint solutions. The Activity remained committed to promoting socio-economic cohesion and inclusive decisionmaking by ensuring that the voices and needs of communities were heard while encouraging continuous communication and capacity building.





1.4 Visits from USAID Mission Representatives

Throughout this year, D+ hosted visits from senior representatives of the USAID Mission. Among these was the visit of Assistant Administrator McKee, who met with representatives from the Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian communities. During the visit, the Administrator observed how informal waste collectors in Gracanica are helping protect the environment and increasing their incomes through sustainable recycling models. Additionally, under USAID's Recycling Matters Activity - Gracanica, USAID Kosovo Mission Director Ms. Eileen Devitt met with several beneficiaries who recucle 27 tons of recyclable materials each month. Three of these beneficiaries have recently registered their businesses and are contributing to the socioeconomic cohesion of their communities through recycling.





1.5 Promoting Recycling in Gracanica

USAID's Recycling Matters Activity – Gracanica launched the distribution of recycling bins to 250 households and 150 businesses in the village of Gracanica. These bins, designated for paper, metal, and plastic, mark the expansion of the successful pilot program from Laplje Selo to Gracanica's second recycling neighborhood. Additionally, the Activity organized a "door-to-door" campaign, informing every citizen about the benefits and importance of recycling for a clean and sustainable environment.

USAID's Recycling Matters Activity – Gracanica launched the distribution of recycling bins to 250 households and 150 businesses in the village of Gracanica.



As part of the educational campaign, the Activity raised awareness among over 400 high school students about the importance of recycling. Ecocorners in schools have been equipped with bins for paper, plastic, and metal, fostering environmental responsibility among students. Moreover, the Activity has also promoted recycling among elementary school students, laying a solid foundation for a more responsible approach to the environment—benefiting all communities.

1.6 The first budget hearing in the Roma neighborhood

The hard work and creativity of informal waste collectors from the Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian communities help Gracanica recycle 27 tons of waste every month. They are aware of the services they need, to continue these efforts and see opportunities to improve their neighborhoods every day. With the support of USAID's Recycling Matters Activity – Gracanica, the Municipality of Gracanica organized a budget hearing in the Roma neighborhood for the first time. Residents of this neighborhood had the opportunity to advocate for investments in playgrounds, waste bins, tree planting, road paving, and public lighting. Meetings like these build trust, contribute to more accountable governance, and help residents access the resources they need to continue improving their neighborhoods.



Residents of this neighborhood had the opportunity to advocate for investments in playgrounds, waste bins, tree planting, road paving, and public lighting.





1.7 Formalizing Recycling Businesses

With the support of USAID's Recycling Matters Activity - Gracanica, three Roma families in Gracanica who previously earned their income through informal recycling have now formalized their businesses. Sacir Tairovic, Ismet Selimovic, and Berjan Celic now run registered businesses, contributing to the circular economy and environmental protection. This progress was made possible through training, business management support, assistance with registration procedures, and financial planning services. These new businesses are supporting their families' livelihoods and laying the foundation for a greener Gracanica through sustainable environmental practices in the recyclable material collection.



Annual Report 2024 12

1.8 Citizens and Communities Unite for Successful Recycling

The citizens of Gracanica have come together to ensure that the new recycling efforts in their municipality are successful. USAID's Recycling Matters Activity - Gracanica supported informal waste collectors from the Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian communities to work alongside their neighbors and municipal leaders to expand local recycling systems. This initiative has created opportunities for income generation while simultaneously supporting a greener and cleaner future. Moreover, through regular public meetings and the promotion of ongoing dialogue between citizens and municipal representatives, the Activity has inspired residents to unite in the pursuit of a greener future.



THE IMPACT OF RECYCLING IN GRAČANICA/GRAÇANICË



RECYCLING MATTERS ACTIVITY



2. Contribution to Public Policies

2.1 Supporting the Kosovo Assembly in Post-Legislative Scrutiny

In 2024, D+ provided expert assistance to the working groups of two parliamentary committees within the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo:

I. The Committee on Economy, Industry, Entrepreneurship, and Trade in drafting two reports on monitoring the implementation of laws;

Law No. 08/L-021 on Foreign Trade;
 Law No. 03/L-087 on Public Enterprises.

II. The Committee on Legislation, Mandates, Immunities, the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly, and the Oversight of the Anti-Corruption Agency in drafting the monitoring report on the implementation of;

Law No. 04/L-132 on the Execution of Penal Sanctions.

2.2 Recommendations in Draft Public Policies at the Central and Local Level

D+ has provided a total of 241 comments on 11 draft public policies at the local and central levels, which directly contribute to improving citizens' lives, with a focus on marginalized groups in Kosovo. The comments are categorized as follows:

>>> 149 comments were provided on 6 local draft policies.

92 comments were provided on 4 central-level draft policies.

These recommendations have been submitted on the public consultation platform and also sent electronically to the responsible officials in the respective municipalities and ministries.

D+ continuously follows the public consultation process to monitor whether the provided comments and suggestions have been considered by the relevant institutions. As of the drafting of this report, the results of the accepted comments are as follows:



- Municipalities: 84 comments have been accepted by municipalities and incorporated into the respective policies.
- Ministries: The ministries have not yet published the final reports reflecting the results of the public consultation process.

Through this approach, D+ aims to enhance transparency and accountability in the policymaking processes, ensuring that the voices of citizens are included in the decision-making.

In addition, D+ monitored public procurement at both central and local levels, focusing on seven (7) public institutions. A total of 20 tenders from these institutions were analyzed, resulting in two reports with findings and recommendations. In addition, D+ also drafted three policy analyses with recommendations for improving governance and public procurement. Furthermore, D+ actively contributed to public discourse on governance and transparency by: issuing 83 media appearances on public procurement and governance issues, publishing three (3) infographics highlighting key findings and instances of public fund mismanagement and releasing three (3) fast reactions to detected violations related to mismanagement of public funds (for a more detailed overview of activities public on procurement, see section 3 below).

Regarding citizen reporting via the Ndreqe.com /Popravi.org platform, which enables citizens to report on municipal service quality, a total of 739 reports were submitted in 2024. Of these, 178 issues were successfully addressed by the respective municipalities.

2.3 Contribution of D+ in **Reducing the Administrative** Burden in Kosovo

D+ has contributed to achieving several strategic objectives of the Program for Preventing and Reducing the Administrative Burden (2022-2027) and the Action Plan 2022-2024, by supporting the Office for Strategic Planning of the Prime Minister's Office, as the coordinator of this process.

Key achievements of implementing the Program for Preventing and Reducing the Administrative Burden (2022 - 2027)

D+ has contributed supporting to the implementation of the Program through several activities, including:

a) Analysis for providing user-oriented services in Kosovo;

b) Meetings with business representatives;

c) Animated videos;

d) A television debate aimed at advocacy and informing the public about the bureaucratic administrative procedures faced by citizens and businesses.



with 1.6 million euros

saved at the central level and 628,688 euros saved at the local level in three municipalities.

Digitalization

of approximately 30 level and 103 at the services has started, local level across three and the analysis for municipalities, and 64 digitalizing over 150 unjustified procedures Key officials trained at other services has have been eliminated both central and local begun. in three municipalities levels. 52 30 Appointed responsible Public policies, including Euros saved by citizens officials, 20 concept documents, and businesses as result 20 at the central and 14 draft laws, and 43 draft and simplifying of 32 at the local levels bylaws, were reviewed eliminating procedures, before being approved

by the government

Procedures simplified,

with 49 at the central

Digitized public services

at the central level

100+

2.3.1 Evaluation of Public Service Delivery in Kosovo

To analyze the services provided by public institutions, D+ has published the report "Towards Efficient Governance: Evaluation of Public Services in Kosovo". The research findings indicate that public services in Kosovo face significant challenges in terms of digitalization and accessibility for citizens. In the Ministry of Finance, Labor, and Transfers (MFPT), important services such as pensions and work safety certificates require the physical submission of documents, complicating the process for citizens, especially the elderly. The Independent Media Commission (KPM) also faces difficulties, as the application for licenses requires the manual submission of documents because the forms are not yet digitalized. At the local level, the Municipality of Gračanica faces an even bigger challenge as none of the nine services analyzed are offered online, forcing citizens to make personal visits for every application, thus increasing the administrative burden and, as a result, their dissatisfaction.

To improve service delivery, D+ recommends that all institutions prioritize digitalizing public services. Forms and document submissions should be made online, reducing the need for citizens to visit institutions in person. The findings of this report have also been visualized through an <u>animated</u> <u>video</u>.



unded by



2.3.2 Raising Awareness via TV Debate: Business Challenges in Public Administration

The debate "Businesses Facing the State" (original title: "<u>Përballja e Bizneseve me Shtetin</u>"), aired during prime time on ATV, addressed the key challenges businesses in Kosovo face due to bureaucratic administrative procedures. The discussion highlighted how these procedures are leading to increased costs and unnecessary delays, creating significant obstacles for businesses. Moreover, the debate emphasized how such inefficiencies are fostering the informal economy and corruption. As a solution, participants underscored the urgent need for the digitalization of administrative services, which would create a much more favorable business environment in Kosovo.

2.3.3 Reducing theAdministrative Burden:A Priority for Easing the Workof Businesses

As part of efforts to improve the business environment in Kosovo, a meeting was held in 2024 with business representatives and the Kosovo Chamber of Commerce. The discussions focused on bureaucratic challenges and the need for simplifying administrative procedures.

The main objective was to identify and digitalize administrative services that burden businesses as part of the Program for Preventing and Reducing Administrative Burdens. The meeting resulted in a list of concrete recommendations, which were sent to the Strategic Planning Office at the Prime Minister's Office and institutions such as the Tax Administration of Kosovo (TAK), Customs, the Kosovo Business Registration Agency (KBRA), the Ministry of Environment, Spatial Planning, and Infrastructure (MESPI), the Independent Commission for Mines and Minerals (ICMM), municipalities, and public enterprises.

2.3.4 Meeting with Inter-Institutional Actors and Civil Society Representatives regarding the Administrative Burden Process

As part of the project "Promoting Fair Administrative Procedures for Citizens and Businesses," three consultative meetings were held with institutional actors, project beneficiaries, and representatives of civil society organizations. The discussion focused on the duration of the simplification and digitalization process, institutional challenges related to coordination, human and budgetary resources, as well as the role of civil societu in supporting the increase of efficient services focused on citizens' interests. Further, the policy analysis report "Towards Efficient Governance: Assessment of Public Services in Kosovo" findings and recommendations were presented. This report analyzes public services at all levels of governance. It evaluates the efficiency and accessibility of services provided by the Ministry of Finance, the Independent Media Commission, and the Municipality of Gračanica.

2.4 The citizen's right to compensation for damages caused by public authorities

D+ has contributed to raising public awareness and advocating for the implementation of citizens' guaranteed right to seek compensation for damages caused by public authorities. This contribution has been made through the following activities:

- Monitoring ten (10) cases in the Basic Court's Department for Administrative Matters, as well as in the Appeal Court;
- Preparing brief reports based on the monitoring of the aforementioned ten cases;
- Organizing informative meetings with citizens on their right to seek compensation for damages caused by public authorities;
- Hosting TV debates to further engage the public on this issue;
- Providing free legal assistance to citizens through three legal professionals engaged by D+ within the Free Legal Aid Agency.

2.4.1 Monitoring Cases of Administrative Violations against Citizens and Businesses

D+ has monitored cases of administrative violations related to the right to compensation in administrative procedures within the relationships between the state (public administration) and individuals, excluding cases involving public officials. The results of this monitoring are reflected in five reports:

- 1. <u>Compensation for Paraplegic and Tetraplegic</u> <u>Persons by Public Authorities</u>
- 2. Justice and Health: Compensation for Medical Treatment Outside Public Institutions
- 3. Damages by Public Authorities: Cases of Paraplegics and Tetraplegics in Court
- 4. <u>Legal Actions Against Public Authorities:</u> <u>Complaints About Energy and Water Services</u> <u>in Court</u>
- 5. <u>The Right to Dual Pensions: The</u> <u>Confrontation of Pensioners with Public</u> <u>Authorities in Court</u>

The main findings from these reports include lengthy judicial delays in handling cases, the lack of legal representation for persons with disabilities, and legal gaps that exclude individuals with hemiplegia, among others. Some of the key recommendations from D+ were the removal of unnecessary re-assessments for paraplegics and tetraplegics and the alignment of administrative decisions with the law. As a result, the Government has approved a new regulation that eliminates reassessment practices and improves access to support schemes for this category.

2.4.2 Informative Meetings with Citizens about the Right to Compensation in Cases of Damages Caused by Public Authorities

To raise awareness about this right, D+ has organized five informative meetings with citizens from the municipalities of Prishtina, Gjilan, Ferizaj, Mitrovica, and Prizren. During these meetings, citizens were informed about the mechanisms and legal procedures related to their right to compensation, as well as the role and legal assistance offered by the Agency for Free Legal Aid for these cases.

In this regard, it is worth mentioning the involvement of three legal officers who are providing free legal assistance to citizens as part of a collaboration between D+ and the Agency for Free Legal Aid. The legal officers are handling administrative cases for citizens seeking compensation for damages caused by public authorities in Prishtina, Gjakova, and Mitrovica municipalities.

The legal officers are handling administrative cases for citizens seeking compensation for damages caused by public authorities in Prishtina, Gjakova, and Mitrovica municipalities.

2.4.3 TV Debates on the Right to Compensation for Damages Caused by Public Authorities

D+ has raised public awareness about citizens' right to compensation for damages caused by public authorities through two prime-time <u>TV debates</u> aired on ATV at 8:30 PM. These debates focused on the legal framework for citizen compensation in Kosovo, the process of lodging complaints against public injustices, the waiting time for state compensation, and anticipated changes with the establishment of the Administrative Court. Key topics included:

- The legal steps for seeking compensation
- The duration of judicial processes and waiting periods for citizens to realize their rights
 - The impact of unlawful decisions by public authorities on court overload
 - The role of the Agency for Free Legal Aid in supporting citizens

Democracy Plus

Ndigeni debatin e trete lidhur me të drejtën e qytetarëve për kompensim në rast të dëmit të shkaktuar nga autoritetet publike në vend.

- A ka Kosova bazë ligjore të konsoliduar në aspekt të së drejtës së qytetarëve për kompensim nga shteti?
- Ku duhet të ankohen qytetarët për padrejtësitë e shkaktuara nga organet publike, si dhe cilat janë procedurat që duhet ndjekur?
- Cili është roli i Agjencisë për Ndihmë Juridike Falas?
- Sa kohe duhet të presin qytetarët për t'u shpërblyer nga shteti?
- Çfarë ndryshimesh mund të priten me rastin e themelimit të Gjykatës Administrative?
 Për të dëgjuar përgjigjet e pyetjeve të mësipërme, ndiqeni emisionin e plotë në këtë link:
- https://youtu.be/2VAlygjS4Wi?feature=shared

Ky debat eshtë realizuar në kuadër të projektit "Promovimi i procedurave të drejta administrative për qytetarë dhe biznese" i financuar nga zyra e BE-së në Kosovë.





Context - Kur shteti gabon - E drejta për kompensim - 19.12.2024 @ATVofficialchannel

2.5 Engaging Citizens in Decision-Making Processes through the Social Contract Activity

As the main local partner in the Social Contract Activity, D+ aims to increase citizen participation in local budget allocation. 51 informational sessions with citizens in 13 partner municipalities were organized during 2024. These sessions aimed to promote participatory budgeting and inform citizens about how they can actively influence the allocation and use of public funds. In addition, D+ assisted in piloting this process, helping municipalities and citizens implement participatory budgeting practices.

This democratic mechanism empowers citizens by enabling them to participate in decision-making on public spending. Through this process, citizens not only address the needs of their communities but also enhance the transparency and accountability of public institutions.

The informational sessions were held in the following municipalities:

Participatory budgeting empowers citizens by enabling them to participate in decisionmaking on public spending.

Municipality	No. of participants	No. of localities
Prishtina	74	6
Prizren	33	4
Gjilan	47	6
Suharekë	56	3
Obilic	72	7
Ferizaj	11	3
Gjakovë	47	6
Vushtrri	17	2
Viti	8	1
Kamenicë	30	7
Rahovec	9	2
Fushë Kosova	25	1
Shtime	19	1





In the same municipalities, including two Serbmajority municipalities, D+ monitored 190 public hearings and contributed to increasing citizen participation in decision-making processes. As a result, during 2024, a total of 1,368 citizens were part of participatory budgeting meetings.

Additionally, D+ supported the organization of 87 community group meetings for each of the issues planned in the Social Contract Agenda. These groups consist of active citizens and serve to address community issues in close cooperation with the respective municipalities.

29 other meetings were held with communities in different partner municipalities to discuss their issues, with 231 citizens attending.

Municipality	No. of meetings
Prishtina	2
Prizren	26
Gjilan	3
Suharekë	6
Obilic	2
Ferizaj	6
Gjakovë	6
Vushtrri	11
Viti	13
Kamenicë	12



Further, within the framework of this activity, 15 workshops have been successfully conducted to gather information on public participation in decision-making involving municipal officials and citizens from several partner municipalities, as follows:

- Five workshops were organized with municipal officials from the municipalities of Fushë Kosovë, Rahovec, Shtime, Graçanicë, and Kllokot.
 - Five workshops were organized exclusively with citizens from these municipalities.
 - Five workshops were held with joint participation from both citizens and municipal officials.

In these workshops, D+ assisted in identifying various citizen groups and facilitated sessions and discussions focused on finding concrete solutions.

2.5.1 Support for Local Councils

To promote the inclusion of women and youth in Local Council leadership, D+ organized six informational sessions aimed at integrating underrepresented groups into public policy development. These sessions were held in Prishtina, Prizren, and Gjilan, and 85 citizens participated.



3. Public Procurement Monitoring

3.1 Monitoring Public Procurement at the Ministerial and Local Levels

During 2024, D+ has continued the systematic monitoring of public procurement procedures, providing in-depth analysis and information to citizens regarding the misuse of public funds. This monitoring was carried out through the analysis of tenders awarded by public institutions at both central and local levels, with the aim of increasing transparency and accountability in the management of public money.

As a result of these activities, D+ has published <u>two</u> <u>monitoring reports</u>, which include an analysis of twenty tenders awarded by seven municipalities and five ministries. The findings of these <u>reports</u> have identified several recurring issues in public procurement processes, including:

- The use of single-source procurement procedures without sufficient legal justification directly limiting competition among economic operators;
- Awarding contracts to economic operators who do not meet the criteria outlined in the tender documents, raising concerns about the integrity and fairness of the procurement process;
- Inaccurate evaluations by institutions, often resulting in delays in contract implementation or tender cancellations, leading to missed opportunities for the effective use of public funds;

To address these issues, D+ provided several recommendations for public institutions, including:

- Using open procurement procedures as a standard to ensure free competition and increase the efficiency of public funds;
 - Ceasing the practice of negotiations without prior publication of contract notices, except in cases where the legal conditions specified in Article 35 of the Public Procurement Law are met;
- Improving evaluation and oversight processes to avoid errors that lead to delays or cancellations of procurement procedures.



D+ remains committed to its mission of promoting transparency, competition, and accountability in public procurement, offering expertise and continuous monitoring to ensure a more fair and efficient management of public resources.

3.2 Monitoring Special Service Agreements/Contracts by Central-Level Institutions

One of D+'s key priorities in 2024 has been monitoring the contracting of consultants by public institutions through special service agreements/contracts. This effort continues the organization's work in this field, considering that D+ has published previous monitoring reports in 2022 and 2023 and has consistently advocated for preventing abuses in awarding these contracts.

In 2024, D+ drafted <u>the third report on this issue</u>, which includes identified cases of misuse by <u>public</u> institutions at both central and local levels. Based on the findings, the main abuses have been categorized into several harmful practices, where public institutions, contrary to legal regulations, sign contracts for the engagement of experts in:

- Policy and strategy development, a practice that contradicts the principle of internal institutional capacity for drafting such documents;
- Performing technical-administrative tasks by engaging experts for duties that the institution's regular staff should carry out;
 - Information technology (IT) services, in cases where public institutions fail to justify the lack of internal capacity to provide these services;
- Legal representation in court is a practice that often bypasses regular public procurement procedures for legal services.

D+ will continue to monitor these issues closely and engage in advocacy to ensure the fair and transparent use of contracts for specific services, in accordance with the principles of accountability and good management of public resources.

3.3 Publication of Investigative Articles

To enhance transparency and accountability in public procurement, D+ engaged experienced journalists to conduct investigative articles on procurement processes in three different institutions. These articles address significant issues related to violations and problems in managing public funds, contributing to public awareness and information.

The investigative articles published in 2024 include:

- "The 11-Year history of the building that left the Faculty of Agriculture without accreditation" - This article highlights the consequences of institutional irresponsibility in managing educational infrastructure projects. The Faculty of Agriculture did not announce student admissions for the 2024-2025 academic year because its building has remained unfinished since 2013. This case highlights the need for institutional accountability and transparency in the management of public funds for higher education.
 - "Suspicions of tender rigging in Prizren Municipality: Is a company being favored with unreasonably low prices in a €100,000 tender?" – This article analyzed suspicions of favoritism towards economic operators and the use of unusually low prices as a mechanism to win public contracts. Following the article's publication, the municipality of Prizren signed the contract at market value, excluding the company that had bid below the real service cost, a practice that can affect the quality of public projects.
- "Million-Euro tender for the KAPS dining facility: Why did construction fail to meet deadlines?" – This investigation covered unjustified delays in constructing the canteen building at the Kosovo Academy for Public Safety (KAPS). The article highlighted the need for stricter monitoring of contract implementation and accountability for delays, which directly impact public service provision and proper use of the state budget.

Through these articles, D+ contributed to increasing transparency and addressing issues in public procurement, promoting greater institutional accountability and public awareness of public fund management.

3.4 Analysis of Public Procurement Procedures

As part of its commitment to strengthening integrity and transparency in public procurement in Kosovo, D+ developed and published brief analyses addressing key challenges in public procurement at both political and practical levels. These analyses highlight specific cases illustrating corruption, misuse, impunity, and gender-related issues while providing clear recommendations for policy improvement and strengthening oversight mechanisms.

<u>"Rooftop Collapse of Prishtina Municipality</u> <u>Building – A Wake – Up Call For Fighting</u> <u>Corruption in Public Procurement"</u>

This report highlights the lack of a punitive culture toward companies that falsify, misuse, or deceive in public procurement processes. A concrete example is the case of the company NBT-ING L.L.C., which won the contract for reconstructing the roof of the Prishtina Municipality building despite its owner having two prior criminal convictions. This situation was made possible due to shortcomings in enforcing prohibitions on the participation of convicted legal entities in public procurement.

This report gained significant media attention and prompted immediate institutional responses. Following an investigation by competent authorities, company representatives and municipal officials were convicted for their roles in this incident, setting an important precedent for strengthening anti-corruption measures in public procurement.

<u>"Reality 2% - The significant gender gap in</u> <u>public contracting"</u>

This report analyzes the low level of involvement of women-owned businesses in public contracts during 2023. The analysis reveals that despite a significant number of women-owned businesses, their participation in public procurement remains extremely low, reaching only 2% of the total value of public contracts.

The report identifies key factors hindering gender equality in this sector. It offers concrete recommendations to address these challenges, including special measures to empower women in public procurement and creating mechanisms to ensure equal access to public contracts.

<u>"Law on Liability of Legal Persons for</u> <u>Criminal Offenses: An untapped potential in</u> <u>combating corruption in public procurement."</u>

This analysis focuses on the lack of enforcement of the Law on Liability of Legal Persons for Criminal Offenses and its impact on the spread of corruption in public procurement. Through three specific cases, the report illustrates how companies involved in fraud and falsification in public tenders have profited millions of euros while the sanctions imposed on them have been minimal, often less than 2% of the total amount gained.

This analysis is among the first to address the importance of implementing this law and the need to strengthen punitive mechanisms against companies that misuse public funds. D+ has continued advocating for legislative improvements and enhancing the efficiency of the justice system in addressing corruption cases in public procurement.

Rooftop Collapse of Prishtina Municipality Building - A Wake-Up Call for Fighting Corruption in Public Procurement



Reality

The Significant

Gender Gap in

Public Contracting

Law on Liability of Legal Persons for Criminal Offences: An Untapped Potential in Combating Corruption in Public Procurement



Public procurement, particularly public constracts, is a crucial mechanism for spending public hunds, weaking institutions to contract for work, goods, and services.

These contracts one vital for many burinesses, providing a stable income stream and ensuring financial stability, in Koscov, public institutions signed 10,183 contracts in 2023, totaling (EBA, VAII, VOI, NO, which respesses 8, 82% of the Corea Deserved Burdset (CADB) 1

When comparing the distribution of these pathoacts between man and automationated basinesses, a significant disparity anternadepending to data hans the Kasawa Registration Agency (KRA) in 2023, there ends (KRA) in 2023, there are 50,990 actions (KMA) (MT-N) were avoid by man, KMAF (MA) are 50,990 actions and the second by a part of the second by man, KMAF (MA) are second by a second by the second by a second by a second by a second by a second data and the second by man, but the sit common then these avoided by man, but there is a officially registered to a source-monet due, this appear and this appearing by a second by a second by a second and the second by a second by a second by a second second by a second by a second by a second by a second part of the second by a second by a second by a second part of the second by a second by a second by a second part of the second by a second by a second by a second by a second part of the second by a second part of the second by a s

3.5 Identifying Challenges in the Implementation of the Public Procurement Law

To identify and address challenges in implementing the Public Procurement Law (PPL), D+ organized a series of meetings and discussions with key stakeholders involved in this process.

D+ held several meetings with business community representatives in Kosovo's seven largest municipalities, with over 60 business representatives participating. These meetings focused on discussing practical challenges faced by economic operators in public procurement procedures, collecting recommendations to enhance their efficiency, and sharing best practices from the tendering process.

Additionally, D+ organized a workshop with public procurement officials from approximately 20 municipalities in Kosovo to gather their comments and recommendations on implementing the Public Procurement Law and identify opportunities for improvements in the new draft law.

3.6 Monitoring the work of the Procurement Review Body (PRB)

Throughout 2024, D+ continued monitoring the Procurement Review Body (PRB), focusing on assessing the impartiality and efficiency of this mechanism in handling complaints. The analysis of PRB's decisions and practices for the period January–June 2024 has been summarized in the <u>report "Assessing the Procurement Review Body: A</u> <u>Six-month Review and Recommendations (January – June 2024)</u>", which examines challenges, progress, and opportunities for improving the functioning of this institution.

One key recommendation from this report, which PRB has taken into account, is to avoid categorizing cases as "partially justified" in the expert reviews. This practice has been identified as a factor complicating the decision-making process for the review panel. As a result of this recommendation, compared to the same period in 2023, a significant decrease has been observed in cases where expert reviews categorize a complaint as "partially justified.

Another important recommendation was prioritizing the recruitment of internal experts and reducing reliance on external experts to ensure stability and impartiality in the review process. This recommendation is currently being implemented, with the selection and appointment process of internal experts in the evaluation phase.

addition monitoring In to and providing recommendations, D+ has supported the PRB in drafting its performance plan for 2025. Through engagement in PRB's working group, a comprehensive performance plan has been developed. containina strategic objectives. indicators, and measurable activities to further enhance PRB's efficiency and transparency.

3.7 Public Reactions to the Misuse of Public Procurement Procedures

D+ advocated for the cancellation of public procurement procedures that have exhibited elements of misuse and legal violations. Through public reactions and institutional pressure, D+ helped prevent financial mismanagement and strengthen integrity in public procurement.

Request for cancellation of the contract for the services of the Capital City Architect

In 2024, the municipality of Prishtina violated the Public Procurement Law in a 12 million euro contract for "Capital City Architect Service" by appointing an unauthorized member to the bid evaluation committee. Through a detailed report, D+ called on the municipality to cancel the contract and requested the Kosovo Special Prosecution to initiate investigations into this procurement activity. The findings were publicly released through a press conference.

Cancellation of the consultancy services contract by the municipality of Vushtrri

In March 2024, the municipality of Vushtrri announced a tender for hiring 40 consultants, with a projected value of €591,841.60, violating the Public Procurement Law and Regulation No. 001/2022 on Public Procurement. These consultants were to be engaged in regular administrative positions that should have been hired through standard recruitment procedures. As a result of a public reaction and pressure from D+, this municipality canceled the tender, preventing the misuse of over 591,000€ from the public budget.

Request to stop the misuse of Special Service Agreements

Between 2021 and 2024, the Ministry of Finance, Labor, and Transfers conducted five procurement activities for consultancy services, where the same consultant was awarded in four separate instances. In three of these cases, the procured services overlapped with the responsibilities of the Property Tax Department, which should have been performed by regular staff hired through standard recruitment procedures. D+ called on the ministry to stop using Special Service Agreements (SSAs) as a way to continue employing individuals in positions that should be recruited through open and transparent competitions.

3.8 Advocacy Meetings to Improve Public Procurement Procedures

D+ conducted advocacy meetings with representatives from ministries, municipalities, members of the Kosovo Assembly, civil society organizations, and other stakeholders. These meetings aimed to discuss and address findings from D+'s reports on public procurement, as well as propose recommendations to for policy improvements.

As part of this initiative, direct meetings were held with key institutions, such as:

- The Public Procurement Regulatory Commission
- The Procurement Review Body (PRB)
- The Agency for the Prevention of Corruption
- The Competition Authority
- The discussions covered the following topics:
 - D+'s work in monitoring public procurement
- Findings on violations in tenders and special service agreements
- Fighting corruption in public procurement
- Recommendations for improving procedures and the legal framework

3.9 Participation in the Amendment of the Public Procurement Regulation

Throughout 2024, D+ made a significant contribution to the process of amending the Public Procurement Regulation, an essential secondary legal document derived from the Public Procurement Law. As part of the workshops organized for drafting this regulation, D+ engaged presented multiple discussions and in recommendations that were accepted by the Public Procurement Regulatory Commission and incorporated into the final version of the regulation.

These recommendations had a direct impact on aligning the regulation with the law and addressing concerns raised by businesses and other stakeholders involved in the public procurement process. Some of the accepted recommendations include: Revising the classification of business information, a request raised during meetings that D+ organized in seven of Kosovo's largest municipalities; removing the requirement for notarization of bid documentation, which imposed an administrative and financial burden on businesses; eliminating the requirement that, in the case of a consortium, all economic operators must individually possess the required certificates; Clarifying the contracting of external experts in tender evaluation committees, a topic that D+ has addressed throughout the year. The new regulation became effective on November 11, 2024.





3.10 Monitoring Public Projects through Social Auditing

During 2024, D+ successfully implemented the Social Auditing project, empowering citizens to monitor and evaluate how public funds are spent at the local level. This process aimed to increase transparency and accountability and improve public services in several municipalities of Kosovo.

D+ engaged citizen groups in Lipjan and Obiliq, who monitored key municipal projects such as the construction of a sports hall at "Ismail Luma" school, the construction of a kindergarten in Rufc i Ri, the development of a park in Bakshi, and the construction of a public parking lot in Obiliq.

<u>The reports</u> prepared by the Social Auditing groups provided concrete findings and practical recommendations aimed at improving the management of public funds and addressing identified issues. Citizens not only monitored public investments but also directly influenced local governance improvements and strengthened institutional accountability. <u>These reports</u> were presented in meetings with mayors, where citizens received written commitments and specific timelines for addressing their recommendations. The Social Auditing initiative demonstrated that informed and engaged citizens can be a key force for positive change in their communities. D+ remains committed to advancing transparency and good governance, contributing to the development of a more open and accountable administration.



4. Efforts to Prevent the Spread of Fake News

4.1 The Launch of the Vulnerability Index to Disinformation in Kosovo

As part of DISICON, the second edition of the <u>Vulnerability Index to Disinformation in Kosovo</u> was launched. This Index provides a measurable assessment of Kosovo's vulnerability to disinformation, evaluating the current situation and identifying the main contributing factors. This Index aims to serve as a policy tool for decision-makers and as a source of information to understand the dynamics within Kosovo's media environment and citizens' attitudes towards disinformation. Key findings indicate that Kosovo scores 57 out of 100 on the vulnerability scale.

This report's findings were also presented at the World Forum for Democracy, organized by the Council of Europe.



This Index provides a measurable assessment of Kosovo's vulnerability to disinformation, evaluating the current situation and identifying the main contributing factors.

4.2 Informative Training Sessions for Youth on Identifying Fake News

D+, in collaboration with BIRN Kosovo, held informative sessions with around 230 young people from 15 municipalities of Kosovo, including municipalities with a Serbian majority.

These sessions aimed to raise awareness and equip young people with the skills to identify fake news, focusing on the most effective ways to address them and the proper procedures for reporting such news. Through these activities, participants gained valuable knowledge to understand and counter misinformation in their community.







4.3 Summer Camp on Disinformation

D+ organized a summer camp for over 20 young people from various municipalities in Kosovo to train them on protecting themselves from fake news. From safe internet reading to identifying disinformation tools and handling information created by artificial intelligence, these were just some of the topics addressed at the camp.

This is the second year that D+ and the Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung Kosovo are organizing this camp to advance the knowledge of Kosovo's youth in protecting themselves from disinformation.



29 Annual Report 2024

5. Reports and Fixes on the ndreqe.com Platform

On the ndreqe.com platform, citizens reported 750 complaints on public services in 2024. As a result, local authorities intervened in 180 of them. The reports from citizens covered various categories: Public lighting, Sewage, Waste, Environment, Damaged sidewalk, Pothole on the road, and others.

The ndreqe.com platform has continued to develop successful cooperation with several municipalities across Kosovo. In 2024, two success stories were conducted with Istog and South Mitrovica municipal officials, who responded positively to citizens' reports about removing waste, even in risky areas. After the interventions, officials informed the platform team by sending photos from the field and showing their ongoing commitment to solving the reported issues.

Solution Solution</

Other Activities

The Engagement of 30 interns in Parliamentary Committees in the Assembly of Kosovo, Local Institutions, and Non-Governmental Organizations

In 2024, D+ continued to support parliamentary committees in fulfilling their tasks by engaging 15 interns in various committees of the Assembly of Kosovo. The interns played a crucial role in assisting the committee staff. contributing to the organization of meetings, and conducting research on the topics discussed in the committees. This program marked the seventh successful year of D+ interns in the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo, demonstrating our commitment to empowering youth and improving parliamentary processes.

To further strengthen its commitment to youth, D+ expanded the internship program at the local level. As part of the "8th Local Internship Program," funded by the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE), 15 young people from different communities across Kosovo were selected to undertake five-month internships in local institutions and organizations.

D+ also organized discussions between Members of Parliament of the Republic of Kosovo and youth. The topics of discussions primarily focused on youth engagement in politics, the impact of parliamentary committees on improving public policies, justice reforms, the free mandate of deputies, and many other questions raised by the participants.

Monitoring Electoral Pledges by Municipal Mayors

D+ and its partners throughout 2024 have monitored the fulfillment of nine mayors' pledges made during the electoral campaign. In the final year of the mandate, the monitoring results show that 74 commitments have been fully fulfilled, 95 commitments are in the implementation process, and 32 commitments have shown no progress at all, as documented in the <u>final report</u>.

For more details on the commitments, visit our interactive platform: <u>https://zotimet.forumi.online/sq</u>

Media Appearances

To inform the public about the work of public institutions and D+ activities, the organization's staff made over 70 media appearances, including interviews and media articles. During these appearances, D+ responded to various public policy issues by offering opinions and recommendations and promoting the work of projects, platforms, etc. It is also worth mentioning the organization of two televised debates aimed at discussing citizens' rights to compensation in case of damage caused by public authorities.

Participation in Forums and Events for Democracy and Good Governance

In 2024, representatives from D+ actively participated in a series of important national and international panels and forums, contributing to the promotion of democracy and good governance. This includes participation in the Parliamentary Forum for Citizens in Tirana, the Open Government Week, the International Day of Democracy held in the Assembly of Kosovo, representation at the World Forum for Democracy, as well as other activities aimed at defending democracy. Through these engagements, D+ contributed to addressing key issues related to strengthening transparency, citizen participation, and democratic dialogue.



 Edding
 Variant
 Automation
 Automation</th



Këshilltari gjerman në MINT paguhet rreth 1000 euro në ditë - video Dailymotion Watch Këshilltari gjerman në MINT paguhet rreth 1000 euro në ditë - Democracy Plus on Daily.



AKTIVNOST DRUŠTVENOG UGOVC

Panel Fac

Supporting municipali public participation pra

Valmir Ismai

cutive Director

D+ at the Learning Summit on Best Public Participation Practices

Sazan Inhimi

The Learning Summit aimed to share knowledge across all municipalities in Kosovo on effective public engagement methods, including participatory budgeting, non-financial awards, and inclusive public hearings.

During the event, D+'s Co-Founder and Executive Director, Valmir Ismaili, joined a panel discussion on "Monitoring Municipalities in Public Participation Mechanisms," where he highlighted D+'s mission: "D+ focuses on empowering communities to engage in decision-making, shape public policies, address community issues, and improve public services. Our partnership with the Social Contract Activity reflects our ongoing commitment to this mission." He further emphasized D+'s role in building community trust across partner municipalities by promoting success stories and expanding networks of engaged citizens and influencers. Through constructive engagement with municipalities, D+ fosters transparent communication and educates communities on effectively using public participation mechanisms.

The summit was organized by the USAID Social Contract Activity.

Annual Report 2024 32

D+ at "Kosovo PAR 2024"

In the panel organized by D+ during the Kosovo PAR conference in 2024, important discussions were held on improving the integration of gender perspective in the design and implementation of digital platforms and services.

Key discussion points included:

- Public policies related to digitalization remain gender-neutral, failing to meet the different needs of women and men.
- Gender-disaggregated data and gender budgeting are essential for understanding and addressing gaps in digital services for marginalized groups.
- The role and support of international organizations and civil society remain crucial in enhancing the capacity of institutions to integrate the gender aspect into the digitalization reform in Kosovo.

D+ part of the Open Government Week

D+ participated in the meeting organized by the Assembly of the Republic of Kosovo, as part of the Open Government Week of the Open Government Partnership (OGP).



During this meeting, it was emphasized that the collaboration between the Assembly and civil society organizations has been very constructive, allowing organizations to contribute to the decision-making process and increasing parliamentary transparency. Albert Krasniqi from D+ also mentioned some achievements, as well as setbacks that, according to him, the Assembly has faced in certain areas.



D+ part of the Forum "Parliament for Citizens" in Tirana

D+ participated in the forum "Parliament for Citizens" in Tirana, organized by IDM Albania with the support of the British government.

In this forum, D+ representative Emir Abrashi shared the organization's experience in collaborating with the Assembly of Kosovo on legislative initiatives, amendments to existing legislation, and monitoring the implementation of laws.



The working group, composed of representatives from the Ministry of Finance, the Kosovo Tax Administration, the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry, and Rural Development, and the Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo, worked during 2024 on finalizing the supplementary materials for regulating the legal framework for seasonal employment.

The group members contributed their expertise, while D+, as a supporter and implementer of the project, facilitated the discussions and provided the necessary resources to finalize this process.





The group members contributed their expertise, while D+, as a supporter and implementer of the project, facilitated the discussions and provided the necessary resources to finalize this process.



Empowering Community-Based Organizations

As part of the project "EU Support for Confidence Building in the Western Balkans," implemented by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and executed by D+, community-based organizations dealing with the past have been mapped. D+ identified 51 organizations, of these, representatives from 11 organizations were selected to participate in the first and second capacitybuilding sessions (public advocacy and campaign organization), with a total of 20 participants. In the third and fourth sessions (fundraising and communication), representatives from nine organizations participated, with a total of 17 participants. Meanwhile, in the final session (project planning and implementation), representatives from eight organizations participated, with a total of 15 participants.

During the mentoring phase, eight organizations that participated in all five capacity-building sessions were mentored. During the mentoring phase, eight organizations that participated in all five capacitybuilding sessions were mentored.

35 Annual Report 2024

6. Partners and Donors

The activities and results mentioned above would not have been possible without the support, assistance, and partnership of <u>our local and international donors.</u>

All of the organization's audit reports are published on our website: <u>About Us - Democracy Plus</u>.